

1 WO

2  
3  
4  
5  
6 **IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**  
7 **FOR THE DISTRICT OF ARIZONA**  
8

9 Anthony Merrick,

10 Plaintiff,

11 vs.

12 Inmate Legal Services, et al.,

13 Defendants.  
14

No. CV 13-1094-PHX-RCB (BSB)

**ORDER**

15 On April 4, 2013, Plaintiff Anthony Merrick, who is confined in the Arizona State  
16 Prison Complex-Yuma, filed a *pro se* civil rights Complaint in the Maricopa County  
17 Superior Court. On May 30, 2013, Defendants removed the action to this Court.  
18 Plaintiff has not objected to removal. *See* 28 U.S.C. § 1447(c) (“a motion to remand the  
19 case on the basis of any defect other than lack of subject matter jurisdiction must be made  
20 within 30 days after the filing of the notice of removal under section 1446(a).”). The  
21 Court will dismiss the Complaint with leave to amend.

22 **I. Statutory Screening of Prisoner Complaints**

23 The Court is required to screen complaints brought by prisoners seeking relief  
24 against a governmental entity or an officer or an employee of a governmental entity. 28  
25 U.S.C. § 1915A(a). The Court must dismiss a complaint or portion thereof if a plaintiff  
26 has raised claims that are legally frivolous or malicious, that fail to state a claim upon  
27 which relief may be granted, or that seek monetary relief from a defendant who is  
28 immune from such relief. 28 U.S.C. § 1915A(b)(1), (2).

1 A pleading must contain a “short and plain statement of the claim *showing* that the  
 2 pleader is entitled to relief.” Fed. R. Civ. P. 8(a)(2) (emphasis added). While Rule 8  
 3 does not demand detailed factual allegations, “it demands more than an unadorned, the-  
 4 defendant-unlawfully-harmed-me accusation.” *Ashcroft v. Iqbal*, 556 U.S. 662, 678  
 5 (2009). “Threadbare recitals of the elements of a cause of action, supported by mere  
 6 conclusory statements, do not suffice.” *Id.*

7 “[A] complaint must contain sufficient factual matter, accepted as true, to ‘state a  
 8 claim to relief that is plausible on its face.’” *Id.* (quoting *Bell Atlantic Corp. v. Twombly*,  
 9 550 U.S. 544, 570 (2007)). A claim is plausible “when the plaintiff pleads factual  
 10 content that allows the court to draw the reasonable inference that the defendant is liable  
 11 for the misconduct alleged.” *Id.* “Determining whether a complaint states a plausible  
 12 claim for relief [is] . . . a context-specific task that requires the reviewing court to draw  
 13 on its judicial experience and common sense.” *Id.* at 679. Thus, although a plaintiff’s  
 14 specific factual allegations may be consistent with a constitutional claim, a court must  
 15 assess whether there are other “more likely explanations” for a defendant’s conduct. *Id.*  
 16 at 681.

17 But as the United States Court of Appeals for the Ninth Circuit has instructed,  
 18 courts must “continue to construe *pro se* filings liberally.” *Hebbe v. Pliler*, 627 F.3d 338,  
 19 342 (9th Cir. 2010). A “complaint [filed by a *pro se* prisoner] ‘must be held to less  
 20 stringent standards than formal pleadings drafted by lawyers.’” *Id.* (quoting *Erickson v.*  
 21 *Pardus*, 551 U.S. 89, 94 (2007) (*per curiam*)).

22 If the Court determines that a pleading could be cured by the allegation of other  
 23 facts, a *pro se* litigant is entitled to an opportunity to amend a complaint before dismissal  
 24 of the action. See *Lopez v. Smith*, 203 F.3d 1122, 1127-29 (9th Cir. 2000) (*en banc*). The  
 25 Court should not, however, advise the litigant how to cure the defects. This type of  
 26 advice “would undermine district judges’ role as impartial decisionmakers.” *Pliler v.*  
 27 *Ford*, 542 U.S. 225, 231 (2004); see also *Lopez*, 203 F.3d at 1131 n.13 (declining to  
 28 decide whether the court was required to inform a litigant of deficiencies). The Court

1 will dismiss Plaintiff's Complaint for failure to comply with Local Rule 3.4, but because  
2 the Complaint may possibly be saved by amendment, will dismiss the Complaint with  
3 leave to amend.

## 4 **II. Failure to File Complaint on Court-Approved Form**

5 Pursuant to Local Rule of Civil Procedure 3.4, "[a]ll complaints and applications  
6 to proceed *in forma pauperis* by incarcerated persons shall be signed and legibly written  
7 or typewritten on forms approved by the Court." Plaintiff has not filed his Complaint on  
8 the court-approved form and the Court is unable to determine the precise number and  
9 nature of Plaintiff's claims. The Court will therefore dismiss the Complaint and grant  
10 Plaintiff 30 days to file a an amended complaint on the court-approved form.

11 Plaintiff must clearly designate on the face of the document that it is a "First  
12 Amended Complaint." A first amended complaint must be retyped or rewritten in its  
13 entirety on the court-approved form and may not incorporate any part of the original  
14 Complaint by reference. **Plaintiff may include only one claim per count.**

15 If Plaintiff files a an amended complaint, Plaintiff must write short, plain  
16 statements telling the Court: (1) the constitutional right Plaintiff believes was violated;  
17 (2) the name of the Defendant who violated the right; (3) exactly what that Defendant did  
18 or failed to do; (4) how the action or inaction of that Defendant is connected to the  
19 violation of Plaintiff's constitutional right; and (5) what specific injury Plaintiff suffered  
20 because of that Defendant's conduct. *See Rizzo v. Goode*, 423 U.S. 362, 371-72, 377  
21 (1976).

22 Plaintiff must repeat this process for each person he names as a Defendant. If  
23 Plaintiff fails to affirmatively link the conduct of each named Defendant with the specific  
24 injury suffered by Plaintiff, the allegations against that Defendant will be dismissed for  
25 failure to state a claim. **Conclusory allegations that a Defendant or group of**  
26 **Defendants has violated a constitutional right are not acceptable and will be**  
27 **dismissed.**

28 . . .

1     **III.   Warnings**

2             **A.    Address Changes**

3             Plaintiff must file and serve a notice of a change of address in accordance with  
4     Rule 83.3(d) of the Local Rules of Civil Procedure. Plaintiff must not include a motion  
5     for other relief with a notice of change of address. Failure to comply may result in  
6     dismissal of this action.

7             **B.    Copies**

8             Plaintiff must submit an additional copy of every filing for use by the Court. *See*  
9     LRCiv 5.4. Failure to comply may result in the filing being stricken without further  
10    notice to Plaintiff.

11            **C.    Possible Dismissal**

12            If Plaintiff fails to timely comply with every provision of this Order, including  
13    these warnings, the Court may dismiss this action without further notice. *See Ferdik*, 963  
14    F.2d at 1260-61 (a district court may dismiss an action for failure to comply with any  
15    order of the Court).

16     **IT IS ORDERED:**

17            (1)    The Complaint (filed with the Notice of Removal at Doc. 1) is **dismissed**  
18    for failure to state a claim. Plaintiff has **30 days** from the date this Order is filed to file a  
19    first amended complaint in compliance with this Order.

20            (2)    If Plaintiff fails to file an amended complaint within 30 days, the Clerk of  
21    Court must, without further notice, enter a judgment of dismissal of this action without  
22    prejudice.

23    ...

24    ...

25    ...

26    ...

27    ...

28    ...



**Instructions for a Prisoner Filing a Civil Rights Complaint  
in the United States District Court for the District of Arizona**

1. Who May Use This Form. The civil rights complaint form is designed to help incarcerated persons prepare a complaint seeking relief for a violation of their federal civil rights. These complaints typically concern, but are not limited to, conditions of confinement. **This form should not be used to challenge your conviction or sentence.** If you want to challenge a state conviction or sentence, you should file a petition under 28 U.S.C. § 2254 for a writ of habeas corpus by a person in state custody. If you want to challenge a federal conviction or sentence, you should file a motion under 28 U.S.C. § 2255 to vacate sentence in the federal court that entered the judgment.
2. The Form. **Local Rule of Civil Procedure (LRCiv) 3.4(a) provides that complaints by incarcerated persons must be filed on the court-approved form.** The form must be typed or neatly handwritten. The form must be completely filled in to the extent applicable. All questions must be answered clearly and concisely in the appropriate space on the form. If needed, you may attach additional pages, **but no more than fifteen additional pages**, of standard letter-sized paper. You must identify which part of the complaint is being continued and number all pages. If you do not fill out the form properly, you will be asked to submit additional or corrected information, which may delay the processing of your action. You do not need to cite law.
3. Your Signature. You must tell the truth and sign the form. If you make a false statement of a material fact, you may be prosecuted for perjury.
4. The Filing Fee. The filing fee for this action is \$350.00. If you are unable to immediately pay the filing fee, you may request leave to proceed *in forma pauperis*. Please review the “Information for Prisoners Seeking Leave to Proceed with a (Non-Habeas) Civil Action in Federal Court *In Forma Pauperis* Pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1915” for additional instructions.
5. Original and Judge’s Copy. You must send an **original plus one copy** of your complaint and of any other documents submitted to the Court. You must send one additional copy to the Court if you wish to have a file-stamped copy of the document returned to you. All copies must be identical to the original. Copies may be legibly handwritten.
6. Where to File. You should file your complaint in the division **where you were confined when your rights were allegedly violated.** See LRCiv 5.1(a) and 77.1(a). If you were confined in Maricopa, Pinal, Yuma, La Paz, or Gila County, file in the Phoenix Division. If you were confined in Apache, Navajo, Coconino, Mohave, or Yavapai County, file in the Prescott Division. If you were confined in Pima, Cochise, Santa Cruz, Graham, or Greenlee County, file in the Tucson Division. **Mail the original and one copy of the complaint with the \$350 filing fee or the application to proceed *in forma pauperis* to:**

Phoenix & Prescott Divisions:  
U.S. District Court Clerk  
U.S. Courthouse, Suite 130  
401 West Washington Street, SPC 10  
Phoenix, Arizona 85003-2119

**OR**

Tucson Division:  
U.S. District Court Clerk  
U.S. Courthouse, Suite 1500  
405 West Congress Street  
Tucson, Arizona 85701-5010

7. Change of Address. You must immediately notify the Court and the defendants in writing of any change in your mailing address. **Failure to notify the Court of any change in your mailing address may result in the dismissal of your case.**

8. Certificate of Service. You must furnish the defendants with a copy of any document you submit to the Court (except the initial complaint and application to proceed *in forma pauperis*). Each original document (except the initial complaint and application to proceed *in forma pauperis*) must include a certificate of service on the last page of the document stating the date a copy of the document was mailed to the defendants and the address to which it was mailed. See Fed. R. Civ. P. 5(a), (d). Any document received by the Court that does not include a certificate of service may be stricken. A certificate of service should be in the following form:

I hereby certify that a copy of the foregoing document was mailed  
this \_\_\_\_\_ (month, day, year) to:

Name: \_\_\_\_\_

Address: \_\_\_\_\_

Attorney for Defendant(s)

\_\_\_\_\_  
(Signature)

9. Amended Complaint. If you need to change any of the information in the initial complaint, you must file an amended complaint. The amended complaint must be written on the court-approved civil rights complaint form. You may file one amended complaint without leave (permission) of Court before any defendant has answered your original complaint. See Fed. R. Civ. P. 15(a). After any defendant has filed an answer, you must file a motion for leave to amend and lodge (submit) a proposed amended complaint. LRCiv 15.1. In addition, an amended complaint may not incorporate by reference any part of your prior complaint. LRCiv 15.1(a)(2). **Any allegations or defendants not included in the amended complaint are considered dismissed.** All amended complaints are subject to screening under the Prison Litigation Reform Act; screening your amendment will take additional processing time.

10. Exhibits. You should not submit exhibits with the complaint or amended complaint. Instead, the relevant information should be paraphrased. You should keep the exhibits to use to support or oppose a motion to dismiss, a motion for summary judgment, or at trial.

11. Letters and Motions. It is generally inappropriate to write a letter to any judge or the staff of any judge. The only appropriate way to communicate with the Court is by filing a written pleading or motion.

12. Completing the Civil Rights Complaint Form.

**HEADING:**

1. Your Name. Print your name, prison or inmate number, and institutional mailing address on the lines provided.
2. Defendants. If there are **four or fewer** defendants, print the name of each. If you name **more than four** defendants, print the name of the first defendant on the first line, write the words “and others” on the second line, and attach an additional page listing the names of **all** of the defendants. Insert the additional page after page 1 and number it “1-A” at the bottom.
3. Jury Demand. If you want a jury trial, you must write “JURY TRIAL DEMANDED” in the space below “CIVIL RIGHTS COMPLAINT BY A PRISONER.” Failure to do so may result in the loss of the right to a jury trial. A jury trial is not available if you are seeking only injunctive relief.

**Part A. JURISDICTION:**

1. Nature of Suit. Mark whether you are filing the complaint pursuant to 42 U.S.C. § 1983 for state, county, or city defendants; “Bivens v. Six Unknown Federal Narcotics Agents” for federal defendants; or “other.” If you mark “other,” identify the source of that authority.
2. Location. Identify the institution and city where the alleged violation of your rights occurred.
3. Defendants. Print all of the requested information about each of the defendants in the spaces provided. If you are naming more than four defendants, you must provide the necessary information about each additional defendant on separate pages labeled “2-A,” “2-B,” etc., at the bottom. Insert the additional page(s) immediately behind page 2.

**Part B. PREVIOUS LAWSUITS:**

You must identify any other lawsuit you have filed in either state or federal court while you were a prisoner. Print all of the requested information about each lawsuit in the spaces provided. If you have filed more than three lawsuits, you must provide the necessary information about each additional lawsuit on a separate page. Label the page(s) as “2-A,” “2-B,” etc., at the bottom of the page and insert the additional page(s) immediately behind page 2.

**Part C. CAUSE OF ACTION:**

You must identify what rights each defendant violated. The form provides space to allege three separate counts (**one violation per count**). If you are alleging more than three counts, you must provide the necessary information about each additional count on a separate page. Number the additional pages “5-A,” “5-B,” etc., and insert them immediately behind page 5. Remember that you are limited to a total of fifteen additional pages.



1. **Counts.** You must identify which civil right was violated. **You may allege the violation of only one civil right per count.**
2. **Issue Involved.** Check the box that most closely identifies the issue involved in your claim. **You may check only one box per count.** If you check the box marked “Other,” you must identify the specific issue involved.
3. **Supporting Facts.** After you have identified which civil right was violated, you must state the supporting facts. Be as specific as possible. You must state what each individual defendant did to violate your rights. If there is more than one defendant, you must identify which defendant did what act. You also should state the date(s) on which the act(s) occurred, if possible.
4. **Injury.** State precisely how you were injured by the alleged violation of your rights.
5. **Administrative Remedies.** You must exhaust any available administrative remedies before you file a civil rights complaint. See 42 U.S.C. § 1997e. Consequently, you should disclose whether you have exhausted the inmate grievance procedures or administrative appeals for each count in your complaint. If the grievance procedures were not available for any of your counts, fully explain why on the lines provided.

**Part D. REQUEST FOR RELIEF:**

Print the relief you are seeking in the space provided.

**SIGNATURE:**

You must sign your name and print the date you signed the complaint. Failure to sign the complaint will delay the processing of your action. Unless you are an attorney, you may not bring an action on behalf of anyone but yourself.

**FINAL NOTE**

You should follow these instructions carefully. Failure to do so may result in your complaint being stricken or dismissed. All questions must be answered concisely in the proper space on the form. If you need more space, you may attach no more than fifteen additional pages. But the form must be completely filled in to the extent applicable. If you attach additional pages, be sure to identify which section of the complaint is being continued and number the pages.



## B. DEFENDANTS

1. Name of first Defendant: \_\_\_\_\_. The first Defendant is employed as:  

\_\_\_\_\_ at \_\_\_\_\_

(Position and Title)
(Institution)
2. Name of second Defendant: \_\_\_\_\_. The second Defendant is employed as:  

\_\_\_\_\_ at \_\_\_\_\_

(Position and Title)
(Institution)
3. Name of third Defendant: \_\_\_\_\_. The third Defendant is employed as:  

\_\_\_\_\_ at \_\_\_\_\_

(Position and Title)
(Institution)
4. Name of fourth Defendant: \_\_\_\_\_. The fourth Defendant is employed as:  

\_\_\_\_\_ at \_\_\_\_\_

(Position and Title)
(Institution)

**If you name more than four Defendants, answer the questions listed above for each additional Defendant on a separate page.**

## C. PREVIOUS LAWSUITS

1. Have you filed any other lawsuits while you were a prisoner? ☐ Yes ☐ No
2. If yes, how many lawsuits have you filed? \_\_\_\_\_. Describe the previous lawsuits:
  - a. First prior lawsuit:
    1. Parties: \_\_\_\_\_ v. \_\_\_\_\_
    2. Court and case number: \_\_\_\_\_
    3. Result: (Was the case dismissed? Was it appealed? Is it still pending?) \_\_\_\_\_
  - b. Second prior lawsuit:
    1. Parties: \_\_\_\_\_ v. \_\_\_\_\_
    2. Court and case number: \_\_\_\_\_
    3. Result: (Was the case dismissed? Was it appealed? Is it still pending?) \_\_\_\_\_
  - c. Third prior lawsuit:
    1. Parties: \_\_\_\_\_ v. \_\_\_\_\_
    2. Court and case number: \_\_\_\_\_
    3. Result: (Was the case dismissed? Was it appealed? Is it still pending?) \_\_\_\_\_

**If you filed more than three lawsuits, answer the questions listed above for each additional lawsuit on a separate page.**





### COUNT III

- [illegible]

**If you assert more than three Counts, answer the questions listed above for each additional Count on a separate page.**

**E. REQUEST FOR RELIEF**

State the relief you are seeking:

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct.

Executed on \_\_\_\_\_  
DATE

\_\_\_\_\_  
SIGNATURE OF PLAINTIFF

\_\_\_\_\_  
(Name and title of paralegal, legal assistant, or  
other person who helped prepare this complaint)

\_\_\_\_\_  
(Signature of attorney, if any)  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_  
(Attorney's address & telephone number)

**ADDITIONAL PAGES**

All questions must be answered concisely in the proper space on the form. If you need more space, you may attach no more than fifteen additional pages. But the form must be completely filled in to the extent applicable. If you attach additional pages, be sure to identify which section of the complaint is being continued and number all pages.